**Multilevel Governance and its Impact on the Democratic Deficit – Webinar Transcript**

First of all thank you very much for the opportunity to be here today and to join in on this discussion

0:10

I really appreciate RMIT’s support for the work

0:16

undertaken in Gippsland over the last five or six years and continuing support

0:21

in starting to prosecute what we can do more broadly beyond one test place in

0:29

Victoria to look at the national agenda so I'm hoping that the discussion will

0:36

be about that today so one I really appreciate that and the last thing I want to say is that you know the

0:41

partnership with RMIT has been probably one of the most exciting partnerships in

0:47

my career Public Service background in education so the Education

0:54

Connection is there but it's my opportunity as part of the trade that the authorities work and

1:01

be able to be very creative and also Rise by Sac government has probably been the most exciting experiences a public

1:10

servant I've had and we've got a lot to learn from that so

1:17

I just also want to acknowledge a colleague of mine Nick Decker who's in this discussion today and Nick and I

1:23

are now currently working on what we can do to influence change nationally on transition and recovery so

1:30

that is our motivation now that we've learned what we've learned they took to

1:37

women so I'm just going to cover those five points today

1:43

the understanding of place-based policy in Australia and that is

1:53

can I just go back to that yeah I just wanted to run through that that list

1:58

what do we actually mean by multi-level governments because I think there are interpretations depending on what you

2:05

know your experience what the research tells us so what does that actually mean

2:11

and understanding of the basic pillars that have been identified through research in EU and what that means or

2:18

how we can progress Regional strengths in Australia

2:24

importance of collaboration and Innovation around multi-level governance because

2:29

the work that we've been involvement that is the key so one

2:35

collaboration Innovation and how multi-level governance player rather

2:40

than that and I want to give you an example of the practice in place just so that it comes to life for you from the

2:46

experience today

2:51

one of the things that been very aware of the national

2:57

scene and obviously we had last night but just wanted to if you haven't

3:05

already read the February monthly and Jim Charmers essay

3:12

on capitalism after the crisis I'd recommend reading because I think that

3:18

essay has certainly been put out in the public arena for some

3:24

very important reasons and I just want to read one quote he says we need to focus our attention

3:30

on place-based initiatives where communities have the genuine input local leadership resources and authority to

3:38

define a new and better future so that if you think about that one

3:43

statement Place based local communities locally LED decisions and supported

3:50

so very important in terms of what it means to be working in place and there

3:56

are different versions of that as well in Victoria

4:01

RMIT also included with a number another a number of other agencies on

4:07

what it means for a place based approach here what is the practice examples and there's a

4:15

if you go online you can have a look at Paul reporting so that it has had a look at some examples around Victoria what

4:21

place-based practice actually is the Lessons Learned what do we know about

4:26

how well it's working what are the implications for that and I think that's a very important thing for us to

4:32

understand at a national level it was now growing interest in place based work

4:38

why I think Bitcoin is an understanding that maybe the practices of regional

4:44

development are not playing out the way they should in the return on investment is not as great as it should be

4:52

and we also know from here you experience and learning that this idea of coffee for all or everybody gets some

4:59

money keeps people happy and how well is that money being

5:04

targeted and what are the outcomes of that has been you know the question in a number of audits around Aboriginal

5:11

development funding so that's very important to

5:16

understand what we mean by case-based approaches I think well the definition is fine

5:24

which means you know this is this is I know I'll read the definition out of this research for you

5:30

it says we Define a place-based approach it's a collaborative long-term approach to build thriving communities the

5:37

limiting of defined geographic location this approach is ideally characterized

5:43

by partnering and shared design shared stewardship and shared accountability for outcomes

5:50

and impacts now if you think about that characterization multi-level governments is critical to

5:58

the success of that so we will come to what we mean by that and these two concepts have come

6:05

together very importantly uh

6:10

the examples that I can talk to today and I won't have time to talk to all of these but the two very important

6:16

examples that I am aware of any popped in is the energy transition

6:22

work happening in Latrobe Valley as a result of the closure in Hazelwood virtue of early Authority which I think

6:29

I started as the CEO six years ago now and identifying

6:36

that is an asset about skills knowledge assets real

6:42

physical assets expertise Workforce where would that lead to into the

6:49

future or a strength for that community and so that energy transition work

6:56

and thinking and Innovation is well underway s and I've just come from another for hearing at least one example of that so

7:03

that's very important

7:09

forestry transition so I was involved in two years as director of Forester

7:14

transition for communities Victoria and also now working on forestry

7:20

protection very much connected to communities and what that means in

7:25

communities where large

7:31

Forest exist how does that play out so

7:36

the examples of those practices and policy applications is a

7:42

growing appetite I believe in our state government some departments a new way of working

7:51

much better and how people and communities view that

7:56

experience really matters so there's some very good evidence around that

8:03

so, the role of multi-level governance then and as I said I think it's

8:10

I think it's the trick here is to understand what that looks like in practice

8:15

and my experience in learning from Bruce and the team at RMIT about the EU

8:22

context at a very high level of multi-level governments from

8:29

whole states through sub states through to Regions is one view multi-level

8:36

governments in terms of you know systems and

8:41

the way that is established and set up through to what does it look like on

8:48

the ground in smaller communities in you know right down to town level right down

8:54

to small cities particularly for Australia Regional Australia what does that actually mean

9:00

and I think I think the two of those we need to understand both of those contexts and one of the things I think

9:06

we need to do is try and understand the top down bottom up in the section and I'll talk a little bit later about

9:13

what we mean by multi-level governments and the way that we've been thinking about it

9:21

so

9:27

just mentioned the understanding developing the understanding of multi-level governance

9:33

as a part of the smart specialization approach to Regional development which is where we started

9:40

and I was just saying to Bruce earlier on I listened into an EU For last month uh

9:49

on just transition because I was interested in what's happening in Europe Associated adjustment

9:55

the messaging I was hearing was very much aligned with

10:02

particularly around this idea of local activity

10:07

so the messages were that we need to understand the multiplication multiplicity of local activity it's

10:14

ideally work on one thing at a time so these are complex places where lots of things happening

10:20

the complexity is actually getting harder you start to think about environmental factors

10:27

economic factors Global factors all of that coming to bear

10:32

on local communities and how they think about that deal with that

10:39

and what are the opportunities out of that despite the challenges this idea

10:45

revisioning over time so how do you create that Vision into the future do with those challenges and the idea of

10:52

decarbonizing and longer term resilience Imports of building transforming

10:59

practices and systems in communities so that when a challenge arises we're not

11:05

going back to scratch we know how to deal with that we've got the systems in place we've got the structures in place

11:10

we've got the leadership in place Partnerships in place to deal with it the third point was about public sector

11:17

sector flexibility again I'll come back to the role of the public sector that's a very much bigger question which

11:25

I'll come to are we is the public sector fit for purpose for this no it's not

11:31

starting to see some early signs of change in Victoria that is a very big question I know nationally

11:37

getting back in this essay challenges on what should it look like

11:44

lastly the point made for a partnership approach and about developmental work

11:50

rather than upfront decisions being comfortable iterative at work

11:57

which is what innovation's about not having the answers right up front

12:02

so really Drew on some of the work out of the 2019 JRC

12:11

technical report of the devil governments and looking at those basic pillars for construction

12:19

as it as an application window for Australia uh

12:25

and I think the importance of collaboration and Innovation comes to

12:30

the heart of this so when we talk about smart specialization

12:36

those basic tools which I'll talk about in a moment associated with the entrepreneurial Discovery process so

12:43

what does it look like when people come together quadruple Helix sectors across

12:51

Society the economy research Community coming together around that first start

12:58

of understanding where entrepreneurial activity is underway

13:04

how that then looks around inquiry Define areas of potential

13:10

the research and testing the specific value propositions and the evidence-based that is developed over

13:16

time with people part of multi-liberal governance and you know the achieving

13:25

action and resources in a direct result finally out of that multi-level

13:31

governance activity becomes really important to this thing very practical

13:36

real things happening demonstration to people that there is a benefit locally

13:42

and that this approach leading to real benefit for community

13:48

that's the demonstration that has to happen because just giving people information telling it's good for them

13:56

it's not work people have to be invested in this personally they have to see that

14:02

it will result in change for their community

14:11

so look at those basic pillars and they're

14:17

really important so I just talked about the process of smart specialization the understanding of the places

14:22

complexities so this idea of a context analysis understanding who the players are understand what's already in place

14:29

understanding you know where people are out scheduled plans

14:35

attitudes why is it working as well as just the

14:42

the general context analysis helps you know that complexity starts to

14:47

the complexity doesn't really get deep until you start to investigate in a very

14:53

serious way because that's when the complexity is revealed even more and it's important to

14:59

understand that that stays with you know

15:05

understanding you know that the specificity

15:10

of opportunities and this idea of construction of

15:16

collective knowledge is really important so multi-level governance is about respect it is about relationships and

15:24

it's about learning from other people into you know both locally

15:30

know their place but also about reaching out to other places where

15:35

knowledge is required to investigate and test something and that can be

15:40

a local University you know research in another part of the country it can be

15:45

research knowledge and practice in other parts of all of those things depending on

15:52

where what people are looking for so that building of

15:58

Collective knowledge becomes very important because multi-legal governance United ownership of that Collective

16:05

way that as I say is a respectful acquiring approach which is not

16:13

about not about opinions it might start off with that opinion

16:18

today is the answer and I got a good idea for you

16:25

it starts with that but it's not about making judgment about where people are starting it's about how do we work

16:31

together to really what do you think is a good idea of what matters to you how do we progress that

16:38

to a point we are together really investigating and collectively

16:46

working on something your benefit so this idea of emergence in developing

16:51

emerging strategies is part of that then so this is a big shift I think in coming

16:56

back to public sector and the way policy is designed for implementation this idea of Developmental iterative formative

17:06

King builds over time and really builds a very strong

17:13

case or a strategy that is very responsibility

17:18

and commitment and shared decision making based on that events that is really a crucial

17:26

part of that development of emerging strategies

17:32

and then this idea of reciprocity so the experience that we've

17:38

had experience that I've seen experience that I've been involved in the members of the team

17:43

is that the excitement about really getting people committed to

17:50

when you get to the point they've done a bit of work on you know understanding to change behaviour

17:56

and system change the point where people say I'm on board

18:03

I'm committed to this I will take control I will commit resources and together we

18:09

can get this done and they actually do that and you get a number of things involved in this is

18:15

when you know that you really have this idea of reciprocity

18:20

and I'll see the big the big opportunity here is to show that government

18:28

if you do it properly you do it locally I was a government agent I lived locally this is my community my commitment

18:36

retailer people who are local we are here yes we are government but we're here to make sure this community

18:42

our community it's the most out of this opportunity for the government perspective and we

18:47

can help do that because Connections in the government so that becomes a very strong

18:56

we're talking about democracy building on the way about people being involved in decision making a democratic level as

19:04

well as a community level influence in Government

19:09

okay the next one so

19:16

the adaption of smart visualization and approach to Regional development I

19:21

think is really important as a sales thing in the public sector for a long time and I've seen many

19:28

policies developed by senior public servants with good intention government's good

19:35

intention and programs developed they are always done to communities

19:43

[Music] and we kid ourselves by saying we will go out and confront

19:50

here's what we're intending to do what do you think does it change much not normally

19:57

but we've done our job and that's the level of participation normally that happens

20:04

or it's you know organizations putting together case studies and case studies

20:10

business cases through consultants and going to government saying this we need money for this

20:17

and that's not necessarily done in collaboration so it's a competition then exists across our community for dollars

20:25

doesn't contribute to Innovation because everyone's able to get money

20:30

and it's all about their community their level of interest and their

20:36

Care Project quite often so

20:42

what really matters though is what matters to people it doesn't mean we don't we don't pay

20:48

attention to that but that's the starting point where are the opportunities

20:54

[Music] what can we learn about where the potential is what we what can we test

21:02

what who can we bring together that has an interest in this as a starting point for that collaboration and partnership

21:08

and that grows over time and we can give you examples we've just

21:13

been listening this morning to

21:28

policymakers to researchers to businesses to local government

21:34

who have come together around opportunity testing we're now starting

21:39

to see that more and more and more so the momentous growing this way of working

21:48

that's the demonstration and it is about it is about you know

21:55

advancing Regional strengths and one of the things that we did as a

22:01

as an authority was really smart to think about

22:06

the smart specialization coach and what is the learning from that practice

22:11

around how you Advanced regimen streams so there are a couple of key a key

22:20

conditions for that and one was around enabling collaborative networks with shared intention and multi-level

22:25

governments and Leadership it's a whole lot of information about defining that what does that

22:33

actually mean so for example you know collaborative Network that recognizes

22:38

the role of each partner their contribution and shared responsibilities for academic

22:43

a collaborative Network that builds collective learning and negotiation for decision making for authority and

22:50

influence a shared between stakeholders I could go along

22:55

so defining what you actually got this actually helps you to develop the practice

23:02

against their new connection with assist how those Define practices

23:09

are going so having an assessment framework around that to

23:15

tell you how well that's going or not going and she helps you think about how you adapt what you have to do if things

23:21

are not going the way expected you have to go back to the drawing board which level of definition

23:28

is going well here and that's really important because you know you can't

23:34

just railroad for people you've got to be ready sometimes a little of Readiness takes time and you have to slow down

23:42

the second really important thinking around this was how we

23:48

understand and leverage a Region's competitive Advantage so that's social economic Environmental

23:54

through the Innovation collaboration so those two things those collaborative

23:59

networks and multiple governments and The Innovation collaboration for

24:05

harnessing the original space are the tenants we think of what Regional

24:11

development and our experience looks like thank you

24:19

so let's just go lastly the time that I've got to a book about practicing place

24:25

foreign

24:30

[Applause] dedicated time to work with people in

24:36

place and we were fortunate as an organization as a bit of an uh

24:44

ability for the state government to test an idea to test a design this came

24:50

straight out of the department program is where the support was designed so very hard little before authorization from

24:56

the Premier Dance School very fortunate resources to be able to do what we wanted to do and said just go and do

25:03

what you need to do differently that's fantastic opportunity but

25:08

we had to learn very quickly about how to skill ourselves how to school team people and again our partnership with

25:16

RMIT and the research done you helped us do that once other research around what was

25:23

happening around the world we looked at the work of Nesta and the capability of the public sector to do

25:30

this sort of work what skill it takes and then there's a whole lot of

25:35

training and working together on developing the tools to do this so establishing a set of tools the team to

25:44

use assessment tool to make sure that we will monitoring how we're working

25:50

again of course having a design around that scenes around that and making sure

25:57

that we were monitoring the outcomes so it's a whole lot of work

26:02

which I've got time to talk about today but that sets the same for that

26:08

now really the real not of multi-level

26:13

governments are just this is my second last point today is that it is iterative

26:19

so it's not one thing or another but at in essence it is about bottom-up

26:27

top down but it is horizontal as well and it's it

26:32

and it runs in different times in stages and levels

26:38

so what it is not setting up a board of 10 people to make decisions

26:45

the very best it's about different groups that come together at

26:50

different times different interests and you aggregate that and people come

26:56

in and out it's not set but it is very targeted

27:01

I mean it's inclusive so finding people who have knowledge and an interest

27:09

is a really good way to go I want to discover what you under what you can't sorry what you discover

27:17

is all these people out of the community doing fantastic things that nobody knows about

27:22

and have not been together talking with people it challenges the status quo with

27:28

leadership and that's tough that's a tough space because communities normally have their

27:35

one two three or four people who believe they are the leaders and we have some very

27:42

well-managed decision-making practices that keep that decision making that

27:48

leadership nicely where it shouldn't be thinking very much from formal

27:54

organizations you know to non-formal as well

27:59

so this idea of breaking that apart and having people involved who might not

28:06

normally be involved very collaborative approach

28:12

is challenging those for state government departments for local

28:18

government rather organizations that have been established who have you know set

28:23

agendas and you've got to work within that context what we learned was it's not about

28:29

competition and it's not about competing with those organizations it's

28:35

demonstrating practical things at the end of the day which changes the way people think so it's still inclusive

28:41

that it's not we've had trouble with why are you going to work with other

28:47

universities when you should be working with the American University only that's you don't have all of the

28:52

knowledge that's needed and I'm sorry about that that's just the way it goes you have expertise in some fields

29:00

that's very difficult that we stuck with that

29:06

so the one example I'll give you very quickly I don't know how much time I've got

29:15

very quick example part of the energy transition work

29:21

identifying places where energy transitions could occur small town in

29:28

Gibson called Garen I don't know whether you know if it's a small rural Town

29:33

agriculture forestry transition energy transition all happening at the same

29:39

time so local Mill we are Innovative local Mill thinking

29:44

very differently about September expectations and energy

29:49

Community energy Parks idea which came up building that inquiry around that is an

29:57

opportunity researchers internationally locally businesses in solar and Battery

30:06

and then paralysis in terms of use of waste materials out of the mill

30:12

two 18 months to two years of really serious research work about what this

30:18

could look like got to a business case state government

30:24

was ready to give Innovation to forestry businesses who are doing Innovative work

30:29

because all of that work had happened and they had been given I should mention it's already provided

30:35

thousand dollars to do that research work so you've got to provide incentive and support but building that Coalition

30:40

was the work of our team state government here you go state government we've

30:47

already done this work s to get that up now that's happening now local

30:54

governments got involved it's continuing our history workers broader Community strategy

31:01

and I've not done that sort of service in terms of complexity and the time and

31:06

the effort and the skill taken to get to that point as I said to Bruce early on when we got back the parts and said two

31:14

million dollars for this project comments were this is the first time I've ever worked with government in a

31:20

way

31:28

they're the sorts of comments back from the community about the relationship with government

31:34

stop stop great great example terrific that's a really

31:41

structured Frameworks so thank you very much Brian Dr Brown Stephen Two Cities

31:53

thank you thanks very much I

32:00

I will be commenting on things which cross the path that Cairns cost

32:05

sometimes we'll be traveling down the path a little bit on some occasions uh

32:11

the two cities one Community I'll touch base on that I won't spend very much

32:16

time on the tour next week but what I want to talk about relates to Regional the regional

32:24

development but what I've learned in governance in Regional development is so readily

32:30

transferable to the broader sense of governance that that work while

32:35

picking up I want to talk start by first of all talking about some issues and then

32:41

looking at some examples in the Aubry wadonga area itself I talk about the

32:46

regional environment part of that I'm talking about the physical the social the intellectual environment in which

32:54

the people in the region carry out their day-to-day lives and when we try to

33:00

manage to bring that to its ultimate there's four issues that I think are

33:07

important first of all there's leadership there's two issues in relation to the leadership that I'd like to comment on

33:16

often a stake leadership for administration of management or

33:21

something like that now there are you'll find this I've came across this one I

33:26

realized that there's a disjoint between the position of leader and the traits of

33:32

a leader quite often they don't come together the second point that I would make is

33:38

that there's two types of leading you can have a transformational leader or a transactional leader if all's going well

33:45

things are pretty much in the optimum you wish to maintain a stability then a

33:52

transactional leader is fine we're not talking about that here we're talking about change and change

33:58

will require a transformational leader secondly I want to talk about strategic

34:05

intent now within the Strategic environment there's five issues that I'd

34:10

say the strategic intent strategic foresight

34:16

Strategic Management strategic planning and Strategic Management you'll

34:22

find that strategic thinking and intent are the prerequisites for having a

34:32

coherent forward View with an ability to be able to transfer

34:38

that into actions at an operational level what I'm talking about there is strategic foresight so strategic

34:46

thinking and intent lead into that but I don't believe that you can have

34:52

real strategic planning without strategic foresight and the management

34:58

flows on from there so they are important issues that we need to address understanding the system is another

35:05

point that I'd like to make now we have to realize that we're talking about system here I've been talking

35:11

about the regional Innovation System and some of the work that I've been doing but we need to understand the system and

35:18

that if you don't know the system if you're not in the system you won't

35:24

necessarily understand it and in in my case Regional

35:30

economic system I look at the core elements that's the operating

35:35

environment the Strategic framework which relates to policy formulation and

35:41

development of strategy from that and the practices which put into place those

35:46

strategies and finally the practices as I saw and there's

35:52

also the agents which carry out that work now the agents are the community there's industry and commerce the

36:01

various institutions social educational and finally

36:06

the government and these are the agents in Regional Economic Development and they work within the

36:12

system they operate within the system regulated by certain capacities such as

36:18

information knowledge creation and

36:23

sharing issues such as the

36:29

the authority and resources to carry out

36:34

their work and there are certain moderators such as strategic foresight as I mentioned viability

36:41

issues like that so they make up the system we have to recognize what

36:49

we're talking about is a system multi-level government governance is a

36:54

system operates as a system finally the collaboration

37:00

collaboration is more than just cooperation collaboration is where you

37:05

have leaders you have the transformational leaders you have strategic thinking in place

37:12

people who understand the system and people who trust each other that is

37:18

so important as part of this process and they are they are the factors I see of being underpinning the

37:25

environment they operate

37:31

on the levels they operate between the levels well I've been talking about is the regional weather and I sometimes

37:38

would refer to that as the Sharon level because it gets kicked around so much by

37:44

all the players I want to come back to this particular issue of the regional level

37:52

now it's turning our thoughts now to the Albury Wodonga experience I want to touch

37:58

on some issues in relationships between the levels two examples of Commonwealth

38:05

involvement and one example of State involvement first one goes back to uh

38:11

the middle of 1970s that was the formulation of the Albury Wodonga National

38:18

growth center program and the formation of the orbital number

38:24

Development Corporation now that was the result of enormous amount of negotiation

38:30

between State and Commonwealth governments have been a lot of work done by the states looking at centralization

38:36

and how they can combat the issues of centralization with decentralization the

38:42

Commonwealth under when Whitlam came in started to address this issue

38:47

too a lot of work done and the councils were involved in a

38:53

bit of that work too a bit of that work the legislation which instituted the

38:59

program instituted the operated under Development Corporation that legislation was the role of the states and the

39:06

Commonwealth the council didn't even get involved the Albury Wodonga Development

39:13

Corporation was not answerable to the councils in fact the councils lost their planning powers in the in the designated

39:20

area and so the author had on the Development Corporation was responsible

39:26

to a minister or the ministerial Council

39:31

now this was a real the cancer I must say the councils were represented on the

39:38

board of the corporation but that's not necessarily good enough what this was top down in

39:45

position over what could have been a great idea the second example that I'd like to look

39:53

at is relates to the building the better cities program which was the

39:59

child of Brian Howe was the deputy prime minister and the minister for

40:07

regional development yeah that was instituted in 1991 and run

40:14

through to 1995 when they wanted to take it through to the second the second uh

40:19

level the second process to finance that Brian Howe decided that he would close

40:26

the operator on the Development Corporation and sell off the land bank over a five-year period of 1995 to 2000.

40:34

the land bank at that stage was about 15 000 hectares more than fifteen thousand

40:41

hectares selling it off over five years would have been a massive buyer sale and

40:47

it would have had profound implications for the region

40:53

there was great consternation locally the councils were opposed to it business

40:59

was opposed to it particularly the Land Development Area that was opposed

41:05

to it the community was opposed to it and the Press were opposed of it now

41:11

fortunately unfortunately hated it there was a change uh

41:18

Labor lost, John Howard came into power and so there was a new set of

41:25

thinking imposed they didn't change the overall idea though they just changed the dates they

41:32

just spread it out a little bit longer but this was a situation in which there

41:38

was a top-down idea imposed on the community and the community again did

41:44

not like it so this is one of the things we have to with respect to changing

41:50

the dates let's just tell you that when I was took over as the CEO I met with

41:56

the minister at the time syndrome McDonald and he said look I've got two

42:02

dates here I've got 2005 and I've got 2009.

42:08

mathematician he took the average and said that we'll close again

42:14

I'll come back if we got time we'll come back to that but that was an issue I now

42:21

want to move on to how the states have been involved there an example of the State imposition

42:29

I'm sorry about that uh

42:34

I thought I'd switch it on to someone the

42:41

the state the two states came together to have a joint ministerial

42:49

meeting in Albury Redondo and after that meeting

42:55

they were to the next day to meet with the community and address the community now I don't know what Steve Braxton and

43:02

Bob Carr had been drinking and smoking the night before but they announced that

43:07

they were going to investigate the establishment of a single Municipal cross-border municipality

43:15

well that just was a lead balloon it was quietly

43:22

opposed by Albury Council and vociferously opposed by the Wodonga

43:27

council I in some respects that was the worst of these three examples because it created

43:33

a rift between the two councils which went on and sometimes quite acrimoniously for a number of years

43:41

and this three examples that I'm sorry of the imposition of top-down

43:47

approaches without that level of communication and that level of involvement which is required in in a

43:57

successful implication and what we what I now want to look at is

44:02

a couple of examples of that in the local area and first of all it's the

44:09

health system the health system in Albury or number is quite interesting because this is a situation where to bring the

44:18

the two New South Wales and Victorian systems together would have made tremendous advances in terms of the use

44:25

of resources the reducive well the ReUse of the use of resources and

44:32

finance this was a local initiative from the medical profession in Albury

44:39

with locally driven obviously the states had to become involved in that but

44:45

they're around about 2010 thereabouts they were able to bring together Albury

44:50

Wodonga Health which is a cross-border organization under the auspices of the

44:56

Victorian Department of Health great success worked well a local

45:02

initiative locally driven and it works the other one is now I touch on the

45:10

two cities one Community this came into being around about

45:16

2017. now that Schism that I talked about between the two uh

45:22

the two cities lasted a long time and there was a lot of acronym involved in

45:29

that and I must say more so on the part of Victoria who I think saw

45:36

themselves as the Lesser partner in this particular group and so

45:42

that that was there for a long time as the as the CEO of the corporation I had

45:49

to deal with these people and it wasn't always an easy process to do to do so

45:54

but I saw this happening and but the people who are involved they go in time

46:00

they go new people come in new approach was taken and there was really good leadership shown on both sides bringing

46:07

them the councils together working through a process whereby you had the

46:14

two councils meet together and decide on the process of the two cities

46:19

one Community structure

46:26

and then the two having to agreed that as in a combined meeting they then went to their own meetings and adopted their

46:34

policy and this was driven by the locals accepted by the locals and worked with

46:41

the locals so they're the points I want to make and they were again the

46:47

examples of in a local initiatives being able to work with the

46:54

top down in position didn't work so what are the lessons that we

47:01

can learn from that I would say that

47:09

at the regional level the regional level of governance the problem here is that the road to

47:16

knock the farmer not the fire we have federal state and local government now

47:25

we the problem is that at a regional level the states are too big local

47:30

governments too small we have eight states something like we have 650 local governments and this just doesn't work

47:38

in the UK they have I think it's something like about 48

47:44

counties across that little country of England

47:51

in the in the United States 48 states in the contiguous area which is

47:59

roughly equivalent to the Australian area Canada that has 13 various uh

48:06

provinces and States Australia eight states

48:12

650 local government areas does not work the imbalance just not no

48:19

good can we address that can we change that we can bring in further local government

48:25

reform but that tinkering at the ages can we change the state bandage not in

48:33

the foreseeable future so that's the situation there so what we come to is

48:40

looking at what local government may be able to do itself and what it has done in what successfully in areas of New

48:47

South Wales and Queensland this form Regional organizations of councils

48:53

this is where you have the councils of similar like demands like

49:02

requirements like resources that can come together and create a larger entity

49:08

the regional entity that we're talking about and be able to take the action

49:13

with the dim with the top down issues well not quite so bad today

49:19

the reason for that is if you look at the federal government it's neglect

49:25

and I go back when when Howard government first came in our minister at

49:31

the time was John Sharp he is on record as the minister for a regional

49:38

development is saying he didn't understand what role federal government had to do in Regional development

49:45

that was an issue there so neglect is one of the issues and the other one is the

49:51

economic rationalist Legacy that we have and I think it's as bad as it has

49:56

been but the legacy is still there and that's a legacy a push down of responsibilities pushing it down to the

50:03

lower levels that doesn't always happen with the required

50:08

responsibility they get the responsibilities but with the required Authority or the resources to deal with

50:15

that so they are the issues we have to deal with and these are major issues when we're looking at multi-little

50:22

governance that's essentially what we talk about

50:28

here I'm talking about look at you know going back to what we said in the

50:33

beginning leadership the need for a local transformative leaders to come

50:38

together they will come out of either business or the institutions or the

50:45

councils themselves that's where the leadership will arise they will show the necessary strategic

50:52

foresight to have taken that action they will have been involved in the

50:58

locality they were being involved in the region they will understand the system

51:06

that's the important thing that we need to understand too that's going to be the essential part of the collaboration and

51:13

what haven't I addressed here I haven't addressed the Border issues

51:18

it's an important very important but there's not a great deal actually done

51:24

in addressing sub-national borders is that that I can see that I've gone

51:29

through in my research there's very little that's done in that but that's

51:34

important let me give you a good example of this during Jeff kennett's time he

51:40

decided that he would extend the daylight saving period by two weeks

51:46

during that two weeks my wife took one hour and 10 minutes to get from to do

51:53

her 10-minute drive from Albury across to madonga where she worked however she

51:59

got home 50 minutes before she left work in the evening yes I had to have in my diary I had to have

52:07

the two the two time frames down so that I wouldn't muck up the meetings

52:13

you know this was across border cross-border issues all over they they had the cross-border anomalies committee

52:19

operated and I don't believe they did much more than sort out the fishing licenses on on

52:25

like you but these days we now have a

52:31

different approach and you look at the New South Wales has a cross-border

52:37

functional economic zone which includes the a range I think there's three

52:44

three New South Wales municipalities and there are two victorians pellets involved in that

52:53

the flexibility of boundaries is also what we need to understand here the

53:01

the designated area under the original growth Center Program

53:08

included I think it was five or six municipalities the that local the

53:15

functional economic area include something like about five municipalities

53:21

different municipalities you've got the uh

53:29

the cube and the Murray rdas who

53:35

addressed something like 10 to 13 municipalities so the boundaries are

53:40

flexible we need to be able to get those all focused get them tidied up so uh

53:47

that's how I'll leave it I think it's okay terrific yeah two great

53:53

that much the whole range of issues I think we have surfaced through this that was questions

54:02

questions and Nick I'll you know just shout out if you've got questions from your side

54:13

just make thank you comparison in addition to both

54:19

presentation which are fascinating because some of the way that's great is that okay yeah of course

54:27

so the way multi-level governance in Europe in the European Union took

54:35

route was the intertwining of the concept with the

54:40

voice to the regions and so in the mid 2000s period after a massive growth of

54:46

the European Union so 2004 with the 10 new countries joining we had this

54:52

conglomeration of 25 countries and the European Union could see very

54:59

quickly after one or two examples of Elections and so on that there was an

55:04

enormous distance between the European Union and the ordinary person you know in the back streets of Paris or

55:12

or in the gym itself and so there was a sense of making an

55:20

appeal to the regions and starting to acknowledge the importance of regions as a place which is closer to the

55:27

population and therefore able to involve not just giving a voice but giving representation

55:33

and understanding what's happening at that level there was also a what I

55:40

call it Sinister that certainly an attempt to use the regions to undermine

55:47

The Sovereign statement and what does that mean because the sovereign state has the members of the European

55:53

Union were the ones who are making it very difficult to see sovereignty over a

55:59

whole range of functions and responsibilities by going around the nation state and going to the regions

56:06

this was a way of undermining the nationalism around the powers of the

56:12

nation-state and therefore the European Union being able to work more

56:18

effectively some of this today doesn't occur anymore and I just give a very quick overview

56:24

in 2009 Lisbon training alongside it was this recognition of the role of the

56:31

Committees of the regions there was the establishment of the committee of the regions there was a voice of the regions

56:37

in the parliament it was like a you know 100 flowers blooming and now we're

56:43

trying to give voice to ordinary European citizens that probably are not

56:50

hearing the voice of either the European Parliament or the European commission and so on and so forth

56:57

the problem with this approach that we now have today is that you can also

57:03

have you can also lose control of the of the regional approach and then in fact

57:08

right now you could say that Regional approaching the European Union has cooled down tremendously why in large

57:16

part because of some kind of some countries at the European Union where this multi-level governance and voices

57:23

of ridges was meant to function it started to unravel it started to take a

57:28

course of its own we saw that with Catalonia we saw that even with Brexit we saw that with Scotland and a

57:35

wonderful example that I'm a little bit more familiar with is the question of Italy so

57:41

Italy actually had long before the European Union woke up to this problem

57:47

Regional expression not just between the North and the South but you actually had

57:52

an antagonistic party called the leg up the northern leagues already not

57:59

only pushing for that kind of voice but actually starting to take on

58:05

governance in that respect and so you see a fragmentation of the country on

58:10

the basis of regionalism and this was pretty much a cold shower for the way

58:17

the European Union started to see whether this was the right approach in fact today you don't hear a lot of

58:24

noise about regionalism from the European Union but probably it's not just because of the fact that you can

58:31

actually lose control and racism starts to take its own its own shape politically but on top of that

58:40

rise of let's say antagonistic and hostile

58:46

theories and ideology is now starting to come commonplace in the European Union

58:52

so you're more concerned about the hungries and the Poland and the Italy's that don't even have to be broken up

58:59

into regions where you get this reaction against the European Union and the

59:04

whole question of voice to the regions gets somewhere buried underneath all of that so

59:11

this is a very different scenario from the two that were presented but

59:17

we did see multi-level governments emerge as a voice to the regions and I

59:23

think it's just simply been drowned out now in our own research and literature

59:28

review that we've done it's no longer fashionable

59:33

I've got a very good colleague in Italy and I asked him tell me what you know he's a he studies the European

59:40

Union far more intensity than what I do and when I mentioned multi-level governments it just laughed at me

59:46

said everything that's been said has been said which is to say we're not too sure

59:51

where this whole conversation is going anymore and whether it's relevant today as it

59:59

might have been in 2009 so there's just a few examples of

1:00:04

the European Union perspective okay I wouldn't mind just coming that's very interesting and makes me

1:00:12

think about what that looks like in the work that we do

1:00:18

and I don't think we 've you know make it recognize that those very voices that you were talking

1:00:23

about politically ideologically motivated voices that want to come together to

1:00:30

oppose and to drive a different agenda we're sitting out in our communities right now

1:00:37

social media was it was it behind the things like the anti-lax campaigns and

1:00:43

things well that's what I'm talking about so that that that happens out in rural communities so when we get

1:00:49

activity going on around like energy transition one

1:00:55

that we had parts of our local communities activating against

1:01:00

that for a whole range of roses

1:01:06

but what if you do multi-level governments properly in a way that way they're looking about

1:01:11

you get Coalition of people evidence driven admitted come from

1:01:18

organizations different levels of authority and they're not just they're not just the usual leaders in a

1:01:25

community they are networked they have family they have friends it's

1:01:31

an amazing word of mouth is really important so I'll give you an example of a wind

1:01:37

farm Victoria yeah you know a lot of

1:01:45

Court appearances and all the rest of it around posing you know they're the ones that are

1:01:52

outputting stickers up on you know on walls and you know out there

1:01:57

campaigning against this is what it's going to do to our community

1:02:03

because that Coalition has grown those voices which are small in number but

1:02:08

they're still active at the end of the day don't get a Guernsey because the evidence is so strong in the

1:02:14

community something to go ahead did it outweighs those activist people who

1:02:22

are not there necessarily for the right thing for community I think it's a really important point

1:02:27

that you've raised and I think we've got to pay attention to that in terms of how do you mitigate against

1:02:34

that I think it's about evidence and it's about local government had a right knowledge to be able to come back at and

1:02:42

say well that's actually that's not true and here's why it's not true now evidence in itself doesn't

1:02:49

necessarily mitigate against it so you have an ideology because it just says you're wrong

1:02:55

and I've experienced that myself in our own Community but the broader Community who are sensible

1:03:02

good people who want their Community to progress tend to outweigh those voices

1:03:07

so I hope that balances the way that it is but I think it's a very important point in terms of the word we're doing

1:03:17

it's a good job two points I'll make first of all when

1:03:23

we're talking about the European Union transposing that to the Australian situation we have to be very careful I

1:03:30

believe because the Australia doesn't have that variety of cultures languages

1:03:36

and that sort of thing which can help promote the issues with the device

1:03:42

bit of Bruno and when we come to in the Australian situation when we start to

1:03:47

look at this and you talk about the agendas versus the other people trying

1:03:54

to move forward leadership is the thing because that leadership becomes very important I think

1:04:01

leadership is a bit easier in Australia would be in the European Union but you still got to find the leaders it doesn't

1:04:08

mean that whether it's easier or not you still have to have the people who are good leaders not good administrators or

1:04:14

managers but good leaders yeah

1:04:21

Brian thanks for that so I I'd like to go again the same point to compare

1:04:27

oranges with apples because at the end of the day we are comparing you know case studies you know some cases from

1:04:34

Europe with Australia now you just touched one of the lessons one of your

1:04:39

key findings was the neglect the federal government neglection which is

1:04:46

which is you know a good point so I would like to ask both of you and so

1:04:52

feed them with your four basic points pillars

1:04:58

do you feel this neglected from the federal government first this is the question for you Karen and

1:05:04

to you Brian is I I'd like to know for example in the case of pandemic

1:05:11

government did they do anything well I think

1:05:18

the response was to give to give credit to the feds that instance by

1:05:27

change the whole thing got rid of the it was at the previous operation but

1:05:33

at least between state and federal and brought in the federal cabinet the

1:05:39

federal cabinet and that brought together a level of

1:05:47

consensus when it came to how they were going to address the address the issue

1:05:53

of the pandemic it was interesting because there was a

1:05:59

lot of clashing in that that still went on between Victoria and the

1:06:04

Commonwealth between New South Wales between New South Wales still lower up managed to do it I manage

1:06:12

the band as a result of the approach a few

1:06:20

unconscious of time but just

1:06:26

there are some issues emerging for me through the conversation that I think are worth

1:06:31

identifying in terms of their ongoing projects to make closer attention to it

1:06:36

the first is kind of all that output from Bruno's comments and the objective

1:06:42

with Karen about whether or not multi-level governance

1:06:48

serves to describe a

1:06:54

if you like an interventionist agenda about promoting the role

1:07:00

regions of Professor access to Citizens or whatever or whether it's medical concept

1:07:06

there's to say whether we're talking about Europe or Australia

1:07:12

[Music] government that necessarily overlap with each other and how do we make sense of

1:07:19

that and understand the implications of that overlap and how can we manage where does it manager

1:07:25

depictively himself so it says one set of issues about what ideology versus

1:07:31

analytic second thing you know I think both of you contribute to this as well to Brian

1:07:36

Newcastle were more focused around the tension between understanding the

1:07:44

relationship of superior governments to lower government

1:07:49

and it seemed to me that all your examples were pointing to the

1:07:55

problematic character of a superior government intervention as

1:08:03

opposed to

1:08:08

foreigners to work the initiative has to be driven from the ground

1:08:15

up rather than up down the example of the LBA citizen industry

1:08:21

way there I think because it was very much if you're like not federal government but it's very much a cabinet

1:08:27

initiative but it was very clearly part of the design

1:08:32

feature that that the leadership would be local and the starting

1:08:38

so that whilst even though it was a top-down initiative basically said we're

1:08:44

seating control to local Representatives that might be putting it into stronghold

1:08:51

but that that's one way I think we're saying

1:08:59

I think is you irrespective of my particular comments there is that tension between in a multi-level

1:09:06

government environment is what's the respective dynamics of the superior and

1:09:14

the lower levels how do we make sense of that the third issue that comes through

1:09:20

to me I think that's again implicit in that but perhaps now more carefully

1:09:26

exclusively by Karen was around multi-level governance is not just about

1:09:31

government it is about

1:09:41

government I think there's three issues that we

1:09:46

still come from through tomorrow yeah and what do you think I

1:09:52

mean very clearly in the liquid shop

1:09:58

what the reasons why it's called governments is to

1:10:05

differentiate it from government and I do think

1:10:10

in our foreign

1:10:25

yes

1:10:31

but I think it's an it's an interesting question because government employees

1:10:38

it does local government state government federal government pay a role and if you think about basic services

1:10:46

that we have in communities that's their business so we're not talking about you know

1:10:53

setting up a new school we might talk about where that school goes whether it's needed it's a different question, but you know delivering building the

1:11:00

rail line I mean that that's there there's services that happen in a community Indian governments whether

1:11:06

it's local government you know collecting events whatever it is are there services

1:11:12

there may be interesting opportunities out of those things but I think there's a basis of

1:11:18

what government does I think we're talking about something different here talking about governance

1:11:24

in terms of coming back to your point leadership is this formal leadership in

1:11:30

organizations and I think your comments about leadership strategic leadership are

1:11:36

really important so not transactional we're talking about strategic leadership and I don't think you have to have a

1:11:44

position organized position to be a strategic reader in the community

1:11:50

and so when we're talking about leadership here I'm talking about

1:11:56

people who can lead yes and Leadership takes a number

1:12:03

I think we need to keep an open mind to what we want you can have Collective leadership

1:12:09

so breaking down this idea about how to get them and what roles they play

1:12:15

it's amazing just had a session earlier on you know a young woman whose leading

1:12:21

work she's just out of University is she in a form of leadership no she's not the boy

1:12:28

so we we've got to understand that that multi-level governance a very

1:12:34

different beast from my perspective than what we're talking about an informal establishment government

1:12:41

it's not what I'm talking about today the government plays a role that can play a better role than it does to

1:12:47

enable us

1:12:55

ourselves type approach and collaborations and

1:13:00

attack is like Europe like some states in Europe traditional

1:13:07

regions [Music]

1:13:19

collaborations growing very strongly so it's like there is

1:13:25

still a lack of consciousness from the bottom to the beginning that

1:13:31

sort of regional Consciousness and maybe for them because this Regional control

1:13:41

that I think it's a really important point and we are talking about

1:13:47

demonstration and why this is a good way to work and so I think there are still

1:13:52

challenges with the traditional business as usual way of making decisions for a local government

1:13:59

to be honest with you in this room you know at the local government and the model as its problems that back to the

1:14:05

point about there's so many of them and they are no different to

1:14:11

people who've been elected wanting to you know have their pet projects and get

1:14:16

re-elected again it's no different to politicians of the state of people so the models we've got of government

1:14:25

actually work against in many ways this because it's it runs counter to the

1:14:31

way they operate but I think the moment that is growing and what's happening is local

1:14:39

communities are saying to their local government you need to pay attention because this is not the way you work

1:14:44

with us get your act together this is the way we want to work those people not

1:14:49

going to vote for counsellors who don't pay attention I think the shift is starting to happen

1:14:55

at the same time I see that

1:15:03

to collaborate with neighbouring towns town so it's like every time oh yeah great he's thinking on an

1:15:10

individualistic and within those sounds they're still like there's still lack of

1:15:15

leadership people that step up and try to think outside the box I think the

1:15:22

forestry work is starting to There's an opportunity for cross-collaboration and

1:15:27

communities collaborating on what they're learning and common things we just be talking about that as

1:15:32

an emerging opportunity and I think

1:15:38

also kind of thought but particularly around there are communities around Australia so we're doing some case study

1:15:44

work at the moment for potential Australia Institute on communities that are

1:15:49

hit of the game here and their local members and their local councillors understand this collaboration

1:15:57

work and they are operating as elective Representatives very differently

1:16:04

members of parliament you need

1:16:10

there are leading ways in which government is

1:16:16

an elected member I think that movement's growing and I think that's the shift in politics

1:16:21

that's going to happen I think government's going to happen we're going to lose ground here

1:16:29

I think that's the incentive for the government

1:16:37

um

1:16:50

earlier so having a look at these case

1:16:57

studies Nick and I from our experience with the LBI

1:17:02

have developed a bit of an assessment framework so what are the conditions

1:17:10

like what are the conditions for success how can we assess what stage of

1:17:16

development those conditions are in and would be really interesting to see which

1:17:22

ones stand out as the ones that are tough which ones that are easier and I think

1:17:27

we've just been talking about whether we could apply that to some of the work that's currently going

1:17:32

on we're going to apply to four case studies around Australia it's very early work but it should help

1:17:39

us uncover one of the things that policy resources

1:17:45

and skill or facilitation needs to do

1:17:54

well doing presentation next week in Canberra so we're starting to say Hey

1:17:59

listen here new transition Authority

1:18:05

it's been announced we've got to try and influence the design of that

1:18:12

it's hard work gotta get people varieties to listen technique which can be really useful in

1:18:19

this particular what we talk about here is the use of system mapping

1:18:25

which I've been involved in a few of those exercises now and the amount of

1:18:33

information you find out about the system that you're involved let's face it what we're talking about here is a

1:18:39

system better in this world where you talk about the many various players the agents within the system if you want to

1:18:47

know how the system operates systems mapping is an ideal way of doing that

1:18:52

I think that's a great suggestion and the other thing that we haven't done very well is Network mapping so the

1:18:58

multi-level governments mapping almost a very good examples a couple of years ago

1:19:05

in Hawaii they had this fantastic map of the collaboration across the country

1:19:14

the European implementations

1:19:20

[Music] no

1:19:26

I haven't it's mapping you are dead for others this is this is the system stuff around

1:19:33

the collaboration where Stephanie Clark has at my app know where it is because we do we do it

1:19:39

not truly collecting that no

1:19:44

yeah systems

1:19:50

you're good it's good to go to an example

1:19:57

some of the twinning has done that but it's pretty lost

1:20:03

the sister city 20. European countries Union

1:20:09

they're very effective in that in that space before but

1:20:15

doing insisted cities today see this I think the two reasons is important one

1:20:20

to understand people who were actually involved the governments to understand what they're working with the systems

1:20:27

around collaboration very important but also

1:20:33

secondly it helps demonstrate to people

1:20:40

see I have a look at this this is what's happening have a look at the multi-level governance

1:20:51

together because we can't show that at the

1:20:58

moment okay

1:21:09

it's ten to three quarters we're done

1:21:24

thank you [Applause] [Music] stimulus

1:21:36

we have a lot of work with the yes but getting some kind of summary

1:21:42

of the

1:21:48

to share them and we've got Brian's notes so you're happy to see that yeah absolutely so

1:21:55

we've got rich Foundation there for another step further and then a second

1:22:02

seminar on the 25th of May at five o'clock

1:22:07

yeah fantastic so they'll two more cases these two this time two European cases

1:22:14

will be a chance to reflect on these issues but also about

1:22:24

thank you so much thank you everybody thank you nice to meet you

1:22:36

thank you